## Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

In the Matter of	)
MARITIME COMMUNICATIONS/LAND MOBILE, LLC	EB Docket No. 11-71 File No. EB-09-IH-1751 FRN: 0013587779
Participant in Auction No. 61 and Licensee of Various Authorizations in the Wireless Radio Services	) ) )
Applicant for Modification of Various Authorizations in the Wireless Radio Services	) )
ENCANA OIL AND GAS (USA), INC.; DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY; DCP MIDSTREAM, LP; JACKSON COUNTY RURAL MEMBERSHIP ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE; PUGET SOUND ENERGY, INC.; ENBRIDGE ENERGY COMPANY, INC.; INTERSTATE POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY; WISCONSIN POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY; DIXIE ELECTRIC MEMBERSHIP CORPORATION, INC.; ATLAS PIPELINE – MID CONTINENT, LLC; DENTON COUNTY ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC., DBA COSERV ELECTRIC; AND SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA REGIONAL RAIL AUTHORITY  For Commission Consent to the Assignment of Various Authorizations in the Wireless Radio	Application File Nos.  0004030479, 0004144435  0004193028, 0004193328  0004354053, 0004309872  0004310060, 0004314903  0004315013, 0004430505  0004417199, 0004419431  000452320, 0004422329  0004507921, 0004153701  0004526264, 0004636537  and 0004604962
	)

To: Marlene H. Dortch, Secretary

Attention: Richard L. Sippel, Chief Administrative Law Judge

## PINNACLE'S PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT ON ISSUE (G)

Pinnacle Wireless ("Pinnacle"), by undersigned counsel, submits these proposed findings of fact on Issue (g). For each separately numbered proposed finding (displayed in bold), Pinnacle provides citation(s) to evidence in the record supporting the finding.

- 1. In December 2005, Pinnacle began leasing spectrum under call sign WRV374 in northern New Jersey for construction and operation of a radio communications system for the New Jersey Sports and Exposition Authority (NJSEA) at the Meadowlands complex. This first lease was signed with Mobex Network Services, the predecessor licensee to Maritime of call sign WRV374, in December 2005. This is shown by the record testimony of John Reardon (EB Exhibit 1A, Para. 14; transcript pg. 1494, lines 5-16); by the testimony of Robert Timothy Smith (EB Exhibit 1C, Para. 8); by the testimony of Sandra DePriest (EB Exhibit 1D, Para. 10). A copy of this lease is reproduced as EB Exhibit 51.
- 2. After Maritime acquired WRV374 from Mobex at the end of December 2005, Maritime expanded the spectrum lease to Pinnacle in New Jersey under a series of agreements entered between January 2006 and December 2008, to allow Pinnacle's Statewide deployment of a network providing critical communications to the New Jersey Turnpike Authority (NJTA), covering the New Jersey Turnpike, the Garden State Parkway and tributary roadways to each, in addition to the network operated for NJSEA. This is supported by the record testimony of John Reardon (EB Exhibit 1A, Para. 14; transcript pg. 1494, lines 13-25); by the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, paras. 2-3); A copy of the December 2008 lease is reproduced as EB Exhibit 53.
- 3. Pinnacle's current spectrum lease with Maritime runs to early 2016, with the possibility of a five-year extension. This is shown by the testimony of John Reardon (EB Exhibit 1A, para. 14); and the lease itself (EB Exhibit 53).
- 4. Pursuant to its leases with Maritime, Pinnacle constructed and currently continues to operate a total of 19 "fill in" sites in New Jersey, 18 for the NJTA and one for

- **NJSEA.** This is shown by the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 2; Transcript pgs. 1533-35); testimony of John Reardon (Transcript pgs. 1495-98); EB Exhibit 53.
- 5. The 19 "fill in" sites are specifically authorized to be constructed by Pinnacle under the December 2008 lease agreement entered between Pinnacle and Maritime, and are specified in detail on the Exhibits thereto. This is supported by the testimony of John Reardon (Transcript pgs. 1495-98); and is set forth in the lease itself (EB Exhibit 53).
- 6. The 19 "fill in" sites constructed and operated by Pinnacle fall within the combined contour of call sign WRV374 licensed locations 14, 15, 16, 18, 25 and 33. This is shown by the testimony of John Reardon (EB Exhibit 1A, para. 14; transcript pg. 1499); and by the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 2).
- 7. NJSEA currently uses the communications network constructed by Pinnacle on the WRV374 spectrum at the Meadowlands Sports and Entertainment Complex to provide critical Fire, Medical, Security and Traffic Operations communications in carrying out its responsibility for the safety of more than eight million (8,000,000) visitors to the Meadowlands complex every year; such communications include medical staff, maintenance and system operations communications, security personnel communications and communications essential to crowd control. This is shown in the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1A, para. 4; transcript pg. 1533).
- 8. If Pinnacle no longer had access to the spectrum that it leases from Maritime, it would likely cause an extended break in service that would have severe public safety consequences. The NJSEA radio network utilizes equipment built specifically to operate in the 220 MHz band. Thus, Pinnacle would not be able to continue to provide support for NJSEA's 220 MHz trunked communications system if the WRV374 spectrum were not

available. The entire system would need to be replaced in order to utilize alternative spectrum (assuming that alternative spectrum were available), including portable radios, mobile radios, repeaters, combiners, antennas, etc. Loss of such essential communications would jeopardize NJSEA's ability to perform medical, security, crowd control and maintenance tasks at the Meadowlands Complex, placing personnel and event participants at risk. This is shown in the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 5).

- 9. The NJTA network constructed by Pinnacle using the WRV374 spectrum currently provides critical communications that help to ensure the safety of nearly 900,000,000 drivers each year on the New Jersey Turnpike and Garden State Parkway. Such communications include those related to road maintenance, construction, road side assistance to stranded drivers, snow removal, coordination of lane closures, and other operations. These communications are essential to the operations of on the New Jersey Turnpike and the Garden State Parkway. This is shown in the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para, 6).
- able to support NJTA's operations in New Jersey. A loss of such essential operations could jeopardize NJTA's ability to coordinate road maintenance, closures, snow removal, driver assistance and other activities on the New Jersey Turnpike and the Garden State Parkway. Given the volume of traffic on these two roadways, there would be a very significant impact on the safety of the public-at-large if this network could not be used. This is shown in the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 7).
- 11. As with the network that supports the NJSEA, the NJTA radio network utilizes equipment built specifically to operate in the 220 MHz band. Thus, if that

spectrum were no longer available to Pinnacle, both systems would need to be replaced in order to utilize alternative spectrum (assuming that alternative spectrum were available), including portable radios, mobile radios, repeaters, combiners, antennas, etc. There would be a significant cost to utilizing alternative spectrum for these essential communications, even if such alternative spectrum could be found. This is shown in the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 8).

- 12. Under its leases with Maritime, Pinnacle paid a very substantial amount of money to Maritime for the right to use the WRV374 spectrum in New Jersey to support the NJTA and NJSEA critical operations until 2016. This is shown in the testimony of John Reardon (transcript pgs. 1501-02).
- 13. Pinnacle constructed its systems for the NJTA and NJSEA using 19 "fill in" sites rather than the licensed locations 14, 15, 16, 18, 25 and 33 because the "fill in" locations allow for better coverage, more efficient spectrum utilization and reuse, and the provision of a more robust service to users than would be afforded by operating from the locations listed on the WRV374 license. This is shown by the Testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 3; transcript pgs. 1533-34); by the testimony of John Reardon (transcript pgs. 1498-1500).
- 14. Indeed, there would be gaps in coverage on the NJ Turnpike and Garden

  State Parkway if the NJTA system were operated from the WRV374 licensed locations

  rather than from the 18 "fill in" sites constructed by Pinnacle for the NJTA. This is shown
  in the testimony of Larry Allen (Transcript pg. 1534, lines 5-8).
- 15. Additionally, if the licensed locations 14, 15, 16, 18, 25 and 33 on WRV374 were operated concurrently with the "fill in" sites constructed by Pinnacle, unacceptable

interference to the "fill in" sites would be caused by operation of the licensed sites. This is shown by the testimony of Larry Allen (EB Exhibit 1G, para. 3; transcript pg. 1534); and by the testimony of Robert Timothy Smith (transcript pg. 1576).

- 16. An engineering study performed by Pier Com Solutions demonstrated that both co-channel and adjacent channel interference would be caused to the "fill in" sites by concurrent operation of the licensed locations. This is shown in the testimony of Larry Allen (Transcript pg. 1534-35).
- 17. When Pinnacle began leasing spectrum in 2005, Mobex was operating from the licensed locations 14, 15, 16, 18, 25 and 33 on WRV374, and after Maritime's acquisition of WRV374 at the end of 2005, operations at the licensed locations were continued by Maritime providing service to end user customers using the previously constructed PassPort system until late 2007. Testimony of Robert Timothy Smith (EB Exhibit 1C, para. 8).
- 18. Those prior operations at the WRV374 <u>licensed</u> locations could not be continued once Pinnacle completed and began operations from the 18 "fill in" sites built for the NJTA because both co-channel and adjacent channel interference were caused to the "fill in" sites by concurrent operation of the licensed locations under WRV374. Testimony of Robert Timothy Smith (transcript pgs. 1576-77).
- 19. Once the Pinuacle leases and renewals have run their course and Pinnacle no longer uses the spectrum licensed under WRV374 locations 14, 15, 16, 18, 25 and 33 to support the operations of the NJTA and NJSEA, it is Maritime's intention to reinstitute operations from the licensed locations under WRV374. This is shown by the testimony of Sandra DePriest (transcript pg. 1361).

Neither the Enforcement Bureau nor any other party introduced evidence into the record at trial on issue (g) that would contravene any of the proposed findings set forth above. Indeed, the Enforcement Bureau, which has the burden of proof in this proceeding, concurs that the WRV374 licensed locations relied upon by Pinnacle to support the operations of the NJTA and NJSEA have not permanently discontinued. At trial, the Enforcement Bureau's attorney stated, "The Bureau intends to demonstrate by a preponderance of the evidence that when the factors are taken into consideration, Maritime took concrete steps to ensure that the discontinuance of operations at WRV374, locations 14, 15, 16, 18, 25, 33 ... was not permanent." Transcript pg.

Respectfully submitted,

Matthew J. Plache, Esq.

Law Office of Matthew J. Plache

5425 Wisconsin Avenue

Suite 600, PMB 643

Chevy Chase, MD 20815

Counsel to Pinnacle Wireless

Date: April 8, 2015

1258 (emphasis added).

## Certificate of Service

I certify that on this 8th day of April 2015, I caused copies of the foregoing document to

be served by U.S. Postal Service, First Class postage prepaid, on the following:

The Honorable Richard L. Sippel Chief Administrative Law Judge Federal Communications Commission 445 12<sup>th</sup> Street, SW Washington, DC 20554

Pamela S. Kane, Deputy Chief Michael Engel, Attorney Brian J. Carter, Attorney Investigations and Hearing Division Enforcement Bureau Federal Communications Commission 445 12th Street, S.W. – Room 4-C330 Washington, DC 20554

Robert G. Kirk J. Wade Lindsay Mary N. O'Connor Wilkinson Barker Knauer, LLP 2300 N Street, NW Suite 700 Washington, DC 20037

Paul J. Feldman Harry F. Cole Fletcher, Heald & Hildreth, PLC 1300 N. 17<sup>th</sup> Street – 11<sup>th</sup> Floor Arlington, VA 22209

Charles A. Zdebski Gerit F. Hull Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC 1717 Pennnsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20006

James A. Stenger Chadbourne & Parke, LLP 1200 New Hampshire Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036 Warren Havens 2509 Stuart Street Berkley, CA 94705

Jack Richards
Albert J. Catalano
Wesley Wright
Keller & Heckman LLP
1001 G Street, NW
Suite 500 West
Washington, DC 20001

Jeffrey L. Sheldon Levine, Blaszak, Block & Boothby, LLP 2001 L Street, NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20036

Robert J. Keller Law Offices of Robert J. Keller, P.C. PO Box 33428 Washington, DC 20033

Matthew J. Plache